

The Democratic Values Included in Sixth Grade EFL Textbooks in Jordan: Analytical Study

Sahm Tayseer Al-Ma'aitah¹, Majid Muhammad Al-Khataybeh²

¹Ph.D. candidate, Ministry of Education, Jordan

²Professor of TEFL, Mutah University, Jordan

Email: sahmalmaaitah@yahoo.com, majid@mutah.edu.jo

Abstract: *This analytical study aimed at analyzing the democratic values existing in sixth-grade English textbooks in Jordan. The population of the study consisted of all content of sixth-grade EFL textbooks during the scholastic year 2021\2022. The researchers developed a content analysis card consisting of 37 democratic values distributed according to (4) fields: Political Principles, Cultural Rights, Human and Social relations, and Religious Values. The findings revealed that there are 1846 democratic values in the sixth-grade textbooks. The findings also indicated that the political principles are the most frequent value in the content of sixth-grade English textbooks while religious values are the least promoted within the textbooks.*

Keywords: *democratic values; EFL textbooks; content analysis; sixth-grade*

I. Introduction

Jordan has taken strides towards consolidating democracy since His Majesty the late King Hussein Ibn Talal issued a decree abolishing martial law and calling for democratic parliamentary elections. The election of the House of Representatives in 1989 came in response to this royal vision starting democracy in Jordan as a way of life. Continuing of his father's path, His Majesty King Abdullah II, called on all activists and political parties to participate in the democratic process, and directed the government to support political parties financially. This has been confirmed by the Fourth Royal Discussion Paper. Also, the Ministry of Political Development was established in a number of governments during the reign of His Majesty King Abdullah II, and this is the best example that Jordan is taking firm and solid steps towards democracy.

Perhaps the educational system, which reflects the prevailing philosophy in societies, is one of the most important means to bring about change and transition towards democracy. Moreover, teachers and students are leaders of change as they embody the trends of society, and this is shown by the educational system's focus on inculcating the behaviors and values of democracy among teachers, students, school principals and administrators, as they are the most important segments of society that the rest of its members view as contributors to transforming democratic values into behaviors that appear on the ground (Al-Khataybeh, 2020; Abington & Pitre, 2015; Kesici,2008).

To clarify that, Raiker et al (2020) indicated that Education for democracy is defined and framed by a society's democratic state; nevertheless, education does not only respond to politicians' wishes, but also to those of proactive individuals in society. Teachers are pedagogy specialists, and their professional identities and ideas are founded on principles of learning, being human, and contributing to society. Teachers have some pedagogical independence in their classrooms, and they can use their own pedagogical thinking in their work. According to

them, as societies change, the concept of democracy must be refreshed on a regular basis.

The responsibility for enhancing democratic values based on the active participation of all members of the society lies with the educators in the educational institutions, whether in schools or at universities. (Tannebaum, 2015; Ahmad& Munir, 2013). Teachers and students are the leaders of change towards democracy. They will only embody the society values, behaviors and practices by building effective relationships based on the exchange of views and not being strict in the teaching and learning processes. (Parker, 2003; Akar, 2016).

Cuenca (2010) asserts that teachers of school subjects are the basis for bringing about change towards democracy when they demonstrate its values and behaviors in front of students, and in their relations with their colleagues, peers, and administrators. Teachers have a noble mission, and they must be committed to that goal while also being cognizant of the substantial responsibility that they hold. It has been shown that unless teachers are academically and instructionally competent and educated, the educational process as a whole will fail from the researcher point of view (Bani Amer & Al-Khataybeh, 2022; Cruz-Ramos et al, 2017; Bulut& Yilmaz, 2014).

Since a result, democratic values have received little study and inquiries, as educational systems have not paid enough attention to them, except in recent years as political and economic concerns have increased. The process of integrating democratic values into the English language curriculum, in particular, has been a source of worry for all policymakers and decision-makers at all levels. Based on that data, the researcher considers it important for democratic values to be taught in our educational curricula, in order to reinforce good citizenship. This will result in qualified individuals who will lead positive initiatives and attitudes towards the prosperity of their country.

The Statement of the problem

In the midst of the conflicts and strife prevailing in the world today, the need to include democratic values in school textbooks is urgent. In order to enhance the concepts and values of democracy in the minds of students, represent them in their behavior inside and outside the school, and make it part of their daily life practices. Through the researchers' field experience, They noticed that there is a lack of taking on and fostering behaviors based on democracy among learners in general and sixth graders in particular, which exacerbated the size of some academic problems, such as the high level of students' violence in schools, bullying, and corporal punishment. Accordingly, the problem of the study is to identify the democratic values included in sixth-Grade textbooks in Jordan. The researchers tried to answer the study question which is what are the democratic values that are included in Sixth Grade EFL textbooks in Jordan?

II. Review of Literature

2.1 Democracy

Democracy is based on several foundations, the most important of which is the participation of individuals from the same society in organizing political, social, economic, cultural and educational affairs on the basis of giving them the opportunity to participate with full will and freedom in making decisions affecting aspects of their lives, and democracy is based on freedom, justice, equality and non-discrimination on the basis of sex, religion, language and social status.

The concept of democracy is derived from the Greek language, and consists of two syllables: (Demo) which means the people, and (Kratos) which means authority or rule, i.e. the rule of the people. The democratic system was absent after the collapse of the Greek city-states in Athens, and the concept of democracy became based on the participation of individuals in organizing their life affairs (political, social, economic, cultural and educational) (Giebler& Merkel, 2016; Doganay, 2010).

2.2 Democratic Values

Democracy is a humanitarian system that emphasizes the value of the individual as part of society and his personal and human dignity (Gomes, 2020). Democracy as a political concept which is not limited being a system of government, but rather goes beyond that to be the basis for building all normal and sound human relations among members of society (Herheim et al, 2022; Ranson, 2018; Kayalar, 2016). The researchers defined democratic values as the ability of the people to govern themselves in order to organize all relations among them for a better, without any type of pressures, as long as they do not harm their religious, cultural and political constants.

According to Abington-Pitre (2015), democratic values are divided into two categories: basic values and secondary values. Basic values include the right to life, liberty, happiness, the common good, justice, equality, cultural diversity, integrity, patriotism, and sovereignty for the rule of law. The rule of law, separation of powers, maintaining the representation of all sectors of society in government, individual rights and freedom of religion, and civilian management of military and security organizations are examples of secondary values (Abington-Pitre, 2015; Parker, 2003).

Democracy consists of a number of elements summarized by Giebler and Merkel (2016) and Becker and Ravelson (2008) below:

- 1. Individual freedom:** Individual freedom is achieved by providing individuals with material and psychological independence, allowing them to make their own decisions and not be forced to work, as well as the ability to express and act, as freedom of expression is one of the most basic and important aspects of achieving democracy and dealing with society, meeting its needs, and realizing its aspirations. It's also a way of expressing disagreement or support for decisions relating to it without fear of being bullied, threatened, or repressed. It is a form of liberty limited by the rule of law, as total liberty leads to disorder and harmful consequences for society.
- 2. Justice and equality:** Democracy is defined by the equitable treatment of all people, regardless of their religious, political, or social beliefs. Justice and equality are to be achieved in the application of the law to all individuals without discrimination or bias, as well as in access to opportunities and jobs, and bearing public costs and burdens, and justice and equality are to be achieved in all social, economic, and political aspects, including justice and equality before the law, and justice and equal access to opportunities.
- 3. Education:** Education is one of the most important aspects of achieving democracy and putting it into practice on the ground, because democracy is based on people knowing their rights and understanding their responsibilities, which cannot be achieved without education and the acquisition of basic skills such as reading, writing, and arithmetic. They should be able to assess the decisions that affect them, weigh the benefits and drawbacks, and ensure that they feel that justice and equality have been attained for them.

2.3 Democratic Goals

The process of integrating democratic values into textbooks is summarized as; growing the principles of freedom as it is an essential and main component of democracy. As well as, asserting the principles of justice. Also, confirms the principles of equality. In addition, developing the principles of the human right to stability and tranquility and protecting from exploitation, monopoly, domination, and oppression (Raiker et al,2020; Zachrisen,2016; Selvi,2006; Cuenca, 2016).

2.4 English Language Curricula

The curricula are the basis for the success of the learning and teaching process, and a real lever in shaping awareness among students, as the concepts of democracy, pluralism and respect for the other are crystallized into other concepts, ideas, values and ethics. Nations on their different cultural levels and different stages of development begin with the process of building society from the school (Al-Khataybeh& Al-Tarawneh, 2017; Napitupulu-Kisno, 2014). English language curricula should be a smooth transition stage for the learner from school to scientific life to the labor market, as it is a language that it is important for the learner to master as a language of communication and communication first, and then he must master all the skills associated with it. The educational policy in Jordan dealt with the adoption of the communicative curve as a methodology for teaching English, which aims primarily to develop communication skills (AL-Khataybeh & AL-Awasa, 2016; Turabik& Gun, 2016), which will subsequently enable him to obtain more job opportunities, and engage in the labor market, as proficiency in English reading, writing and speaking has become an urgent necessity, since it is the language of technology, scientific research and the modern era. It is considered an official language in university fields of study such as medicine, engineering and others. Therefore, learning the language cannot take place in a day and a night. We need to have the right start of education from the first grades in the basic stage to pre-university, and to provide the learner with the life skills in which he coexists in his daily life and qualify him to work in the future. The defect in teaching skills has led to the reluctance of many students to learn English and absenteeism from school because it has become a difficult language for them which they cannot understand.

2.5 Previous Studies

Al-Azzam (2013) undertook a study with the goal of discovering the truth of Jordanian political culture after twenty years of political openness by identifying the most important characteristics of contemporary Jordanian political culture. In addition, the study will look into the major factors that influence this political culture. The study employed a descriptive-analytical methodology to examine the survey's findings, which include the distribution of 400 questionnaires to five groups of Jordanian political elites. The study indicated that a truly democratic system in Jordan cannot exist without the creation and consolidation of democratic values in Jordanian citizens' political culture. Another finding of the study is that, despite twenty years of political liberalization, traditional political culture still prevails in Jordanian society, which is influenced by social, tribal, and family relations.

Bulut and Yilmaz (2014) conducted a study in Turkey that aimed to identify the degree to which teachers' practice democratic values and its relationship to students' performance in mathematics. The study sample consisted of (522) male and female students from (6) primary schools. To achieve the objective of the study, the democratic practices scale and the student performance scale were used. The results of the study showed that the students' performance in mathematics was moderate. The results revealed a positive, statistically significant relationship between teachers' democratic practices in schools and students' performance in mathematics.

Turabik and Gun (2016) conducted a study in Turkey that aimed to identify the relationship between teachers' attitudes towards practicing democratic values and classroom management and its relationship to students' performance in critical thinking. The study sample consisted of (530) male and female students in secondary schools. To achieve the objective of the study, the scale of democratic practices in classroom management, and the scale of students' performance in critical thinking were used. The results of the study showed that teachers' attitudes towards practicing democratic values in classroom management were moderate. The results also showed that there were no statistically significant differences for the practice of teachers' democratic values in classroom management and its relationship to students' performance in critical thinking due to the gender variable. The results also showed a positive and statistically significant correlation between teachers' democratic practices in classroom management and students' performance in critical thinking.

Akar (2016) conducted a study in Turkey aimed at identifying the perceptions of students of the Faculty of Education at Ankara University about the democratic values of faculty members. The study sample consisted of (248) male and female students from the Faculty of Education who were chosen randomly. To achieve the objective of the study, a scale of students' perceptions of democratic values among faculty members was developed, and it was used in the data collection process. The results of the study showed that the level of democratic values among faculty members from the students' point of view ranged from low to medium. The results also showed that the most important democratic values from the students' point of view were respect for others, justice and equality in dealing between faculty members and students.

Kaylar's study (2016) in Turkey and Ukraine aimed at comparing the attitudes of law students in Turkish and Ukrainian universities towards democratic values. The study sample consisted of (226) male and female students from faculties of law who were randomly selected. To achieve the aim of the study, the democratic values scale was used in the data collection process. The results of the study showed that the attitudes of students of law faculties in Turkish and Ukrainian universities were positive, and that the most important values for them were justice and equality, respect for others, social justice and freedom of expression.

The study conducted by Zachrisen (2016) in the United States of America aimed at knowing the impact of teachers' practice of democratic behaviors in promoting the values of democracy among students. The study sample consisted of (48) first graders, who were randomly selected. To achieve the aim of the study, an observation card developed by the researcher was used. The results of the study showed that there is a positive effect of teachers' democratic practices in promoting democratic values among students.

Aladag and Ciftci (2017) conducted a study in Turkey that aimed at investigating the relationship between digital citizenship levels of pre-service primary school teachers and their democratic values. The research was designed in descriptive survey model. The research was conducted with the participation of (346) pre-service primary school teachers (juniors and seniors) from Adnan Menderes University and Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University. Digital citizenship scale and democratic values scale were used as the data collection instruments. The results of the study revealed that there is a statistically insignificant difference among the pre-service primary school teachers' digital citizenship scores in terms of the variables of gender and class. As for the democratic values score, it was observed that there is a statistically significant difference among the pre-service primary school teachers' scores in terms of gender, having access to the Internet connection, the duration of the Internet user

experience, and the duration of the daily Internet use. Democratic values scores differ significantly in terms of class and perceived level of the Internet using skills. When the scores are taken from the digital citizenship and democratic values scales are analyzed, it is observed that there is a weak positive correlation between these two variables.

Gomes (2020) conducted a study aiming to identify the existence, comprehension, and application of democratic values in seven public elementary schools in Bangladesh. To investigate the topic, the study took a qualitative approach and used a purposive sampling of teachers. The analytical framework is built by delving into the perspectives of Gert Biesta, John Dewey, and Patricia White on democratic values. The framework discussion resulted in democratic principles of participation, freedom, and courage, which were used to aid in the investigation of the thesis's key research issues. Document analysis and semi-structured interviews were employed as data gathering methods to investigate the study's two research objectives. At seven schools, individual and group interviews were conducted with teachers to gain insight into their democratic understanding and practice. The findings of the two research questions, using the analytical framework's outcome, show that participants have a very basic understanding of democratic, moral civic, and citizenship ideals.

III. Research Method

3.1 The Study Design

This is a descriptive-analytic study that is designed to analyze the democratic values included in the sixth-grade EFL textbooks in Jordan.

3.2 Population of the Study

The population of the study consisted of all content of sixth-grade EFL textbooks (Student's Book and Activity Book) for 6th Grade, taught by the Ministry of Education during the scholastic year 2021\2022. Table 1 shows the distribution of the population of the study.

Table 1. The distribution of the population of the study

Sixth-Grade EFL Textbooks			
Units		Pages	
Student's Book 14 units	Activity Book 14 units	Student's Book 80	Activity Book 80

3.3 Instrument of the Study

As related to the question of the study, the researchers have prepared a checklist consisting of (37) democratic values distributed according to (4) domains which are: Political Principles, Cultural Rights, Human and Social relations, and Religious Values. Originally, the values of the checklist were selected, modified, adapted, and finally adopted from the theoretical literature and previous studies reviewed by the researchers.

3.4 Validity of the Instrument

The researchers have presented the instrument of the study to a jury of experts in teaching the English language, education, methodology, measurement, and evaluation, in addition to experienced educational supervisors and EFL teachers. The jury was asked to delete, add, or change any value. The researchers adopted their suggestions.

3.5 Reliability of the Instrument

The reliability of the instrument was examined by using the Holsti method; each researcher separately analyzed the English language textbooks for the sixth grade according to the analysis instrument of the study. The ratio of agreement between the researchers was calculated using the Holsti equation which was (88.75%) which is considered a high reliability coefficient that can be adopted for the current study purposes.

3.6 Analysis Units

The researchers adopted the word, the sentence, the paragraph, the picture/image/photo, and the sign contained in the English language textbooks for the sixth grade in Jordan as analysis units.

3.7 The Study Procedures

The researchers followed these procedures:

1. Reviewing the related literature and previous studies to prepare the list of democratic values. They prepared a list consisting of (37) democratic values, then examine the reliability and validity of this instrument.
2. Analyzing the whole content of sixth-grade English language textbooks to determine the frequencies, percentages, and ranks of the included democratic values.
3. Drawing tables including the list of democratic values.
4. Results, discussion and recommendation were listed

IV. Results and Discussion

The results related to the study question "what are the democratic values that are included in Sixth Grade EFL textbooks in Jordan"?

Table 2 shows the domains of the democratic values that are included in Sixth Grade EFL textbooks in Jordan a descending order according to their frequencies and percentages.

Table 2. Democratic values included in the sixth grade EFL textbooks

Domains Democratic Values	Frequencies	Percentages	Rank
Political Principles	778	42.15%	1
Cultural Rights	590	31.96%	2
Human and Social Relations	388	21.02%	3
Religious Values	90	4.88%	4
Total	1846	100%	

Table (2) illustrates that the set of democratic values have been distributed on the English language textbooks of the sixth grade over a span between (4.88% - 42.15%). Political Principles has the highest ration in these textbooks with the percentage of (42.15%) and (778) frequencies, followed by Cultural Rights in the second rank where their percentage was (31.96%) and (590) frequencies. In the third rank were Human and Social Relations with a percentage of (21.02%) and (388) frequencies. The lowest values in frequency were Religious Values with a percentage of (4.88%) and (90).

Table 3. Political Principles values included in the sixth grade EFL textbooks

Values	Frequencies	Percentages	Rank
Freedom of expression	46	5.91%	4
Justice	5	0.64%	6
Right to equal opportunity	24	3.08%	5

Loyalty and affiliation	443	56.94%	1
Respect for law	85	10.93%	3
Application of law	85	10.93%	3
Protection against danger and illness	90	11.57%	2
Right for election	0	0.00%	7
Rule of law	0	0.00%	7
Total	778	100%	

Table 3 shows the percentages for the 6th grade ranged over a span between (0-56.9) with the total of (778) frequencies. Loyalty and affiliation got the highest 443 frequencies, 56.94%. The lowest is both Right for election and Rule of law (0) frequency for each.

Table 4. Cultural Rights values included in the sixth grade EFL textbooks

Values	Frequencies	Percentages	Rank
Right to education	201	34.07%	1
Right to creativity and innovation	196	33.22%	2
Freedom of the media and the press	11	1.86%	5
Right to own technology	21	3.56%	4
Right to employ technology	161	27.29%	3
Total	590	100%	

Table 4 shows the percentages for the 6th grade ranged over a span between (1.9-34.1) with the total of (590) frequencies. Right to education got the highest 201 frequencies, 34.07%. The lowest is Freedom of the media and the press 11 frequencies, 1.86%.

Table 5. Human and Social Relations values included in the sixth grade EFL textbooks

Values	Frequencies	Percentages	Rank
Respect for human dignity	6	1.55%	10
Respect for human rights	10	2.58%	9
Tolerance with the other	16	4.12%	8
Cooperation with the other	103	26.55%	1
Brotherhood and solidarity	72	18.56%	2
Positive dialogue	6	1.55%	10
Constructive negotiation	5	1.29%	11
Right to health care	71	18.30%	3
Acceptance of the other	20	5.15%	6
Integrity and impartiality	0	0.00%	13
Rejection of violence	0	0.00%	13
Consultation with the other	17	4.38%	7
Constructive opposition	0	0.00%	13
Respect for the other opinion	1	0.26%	12
Individual and collective personality	38	9.79%	4
Personal freedom in accordance with religious and cultural systems	23	5.93%	5
Total	388	100%	

Table 5 shows the percentages for the 6th grade ranged over a span between (0.3-26.5) with the total of (388) frequencies. Cooperation with the other got the highest 103 frequencies, 26.55%. The lowest is "Integrity and impartiality", "Rejection of violence" and "Constructive opposition" (0) frequency.

Table 6. Religious Values included in the sixth grade EFL textbooks

Values	Frequencies	Percentages	Rank
Giving advice	5	5.56%	5
Philanthropy	34	37.78%	1
Sincerity	6	6.67%	4
Moderation	26	28.89%	2
Honesty	2	2.22%	6
Shura	17	18.89%	3
Total	90	100%	

Table 6 shows the percentages for the 6th grade ranged over a span between (2.2-37.8) with the total of (90) frequencies. Philanthropy got the highest 34 frequencies, 37.78%. The lowest is Honesty 2 frequencies, 2.22%.

Discussion

The results showed that the democratic values included in the EFL for the sixth grade were 1864 values, where the political principles ranked first, and value (Loyalty and affiliation) was the first rank of 443 frequencies, and this result may be attributed to the curriculum designers' awareness of the importance of instilling the value of loyalty to the Hashemite leadership and belonging to the homeland among students. In the second rank was cultural rights, and value (Right to education) was the first rank of 201 frequencies, and this result may be attributed to the curriculum designers' awareness of the significance of instilling a love of education and enhancing the values of knowledge among students in the early stages, which contributes to the development of their attitudes towards education.

The third rank was human and social relations, and value (Cooperation with the other) was the first rank of 103 frequencies. This result may be attributed to the awareness of the Ministry of Education of the importance of developing relations between students themselves and with others, which leads to the promotion of social values in society.

The last rank was religious values, and value (Philanthropy) was the first rank of 34 frequencies. This is due to the inappropriateness of the activities and exercises in these textbooks, in addition to there being an independent subject in the educational system that works to teach and reinforce religious values for students

IV. Conclusion

The Results demonstrate the dominance of Political Principles values 778 frequencies. Whereas the values of Cultural Rights are secondly ranked with 590 frequencies, Human and Social Relations values come third with 388 frequencies, and the religious values come forth with 90 frequencies. Also, the study shows that the distribution of democratic values in the English language textbooks of the sixth grade was random and do not achieve the desired interest. Due to this result, there is no appropriate strategy used to include democratic values in the English language textbooks of the sixth grade.

Recommendations

In light of the results of the current study, the researchers recommend the following:

- 1 Jordanian EFL learners ought to be made aware of the democratic values existing in the textbooks they learn.
- 2 EFL textbook designers have to allot democratic values more weight depending on the

- democratic approach advocated by His Majesty King Abdullah II bin Al Hussein.
- 3 Curriculum designers should give important democratic values such as integrity and impartiality as well as rejection of violence more weight as sixth-grade students are in bad need of these democratic values.

References

- Abington – Pitre, A. (2015). *Where did We Go Wrong? Eight Characteristics of Multicultural Schools*. Universal Journal of Educational Research, 3 (2), 99 -103.
- Ahmad, N.; Khan, F. & Munir, N. (2013). *Factors affecting the Learning of English at Secondary School Level in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan*. International Journal of English Language and Literature Studies, 2 (2), 95 – 101.
- Akar, C. (2016). *Investigating the Students' Perceptions of the Democratic Values of Academicians*. Journal of Social Studies Education Research, 7 (1), 96 – 139.
- Aladag, S. & Ciftci, S. (2017). *An Investigation of the Relationship between Digital Citizenship Levels of Pre-service Primary School Teachers and their Democratic Values*. European Journal of education Studies, 3 (6), 171 – 184.
- Al-Azzam, Amin A. (2013). *Cultural Obstacles to Democratization in Jordan – The Reality of Political Culture in Jordan after Twenty Years of Political openness*. The Arab Journal for Arts, 10 (2A), 49 – 83.
- Al-Khataybeh, MM, Al-Tarawneh, S. (2017). The effect of using Renzulli learning system and SCAMPER strategy on developing tenth grade writing English composition skills at Mu'tah Model School. *Al-Manarah* 23(3): 555–588.
- Al-Khataybeh, Majid (2020). Female Representation in EFL Elementary Stage Textbooks in K.S.A. *The Asian ESP Journal*, 16(1), 20-37.
<https://www.elejournals.com/download?code=6074612c77d2d>
- AL-Khataybeh, M., & AL-Awasa, A. (2016). The Effect of Using Web Quests on Improving Seventh Grade Female Students' Writing Skills in Southern AL-Mazar Directorate of Education. *Journal of Education & Social Policy*, 3(1), 1-112.
- Bani Amer, M & Al-Khataybeh, M (2022). Analyzing the Content of 2nd Secondary School Grade English Language Textbooks in Light of Life Skills in Jordan. *Britain International of Linguistics, Arts and Education Sciences Journal*, 4 (1).
- Becker, P. & Ravelson, J. (2008). *What Is Democracy?* USA: KMF-CNOE & NOVA STELLA.
- Bulut, I. & Yilmaz, F. (2014). *The Relationship between Mathematics Teachers' democratic Behavior and Students' Mathematics Success*. International Online Journal of Educational Sciences, 6 (3), 626 – 637.
- Cruz-Ramos, A.; Heredia-Escorza, Y. & Cannon-Diaz, B. (2017). Academic performance and family cohesion in a private junior high school in the U.S.-Mexico border. *World Journal Education*, 7 (5), 31-83.
- Cuenca, A. (2010). Democratic means for democratic ends. *The Possibilities of Bakhtin's Dialogue Pedagogy for social Studies*, 102 (1), 42-84.
- Doganay, A. (2010). *What does Democracy Mean to 14-year-old Turkish Children? A Comparison with Results of the 1999 IEA Civic Education Study*. Research Report in Education, 25 (1), 51 – 71.
- Giebler, H. & Merkel, W. (2016). *Freedom and Equality in Democracies: Is There a Trade-off?* International Political Sciences Review, 3 (5), 594 – 605.
- Gomes, Raxy R. (2020). *Democratic values in public primary schools in Bangladesh: A qualitative investigation*. University of South-Eastern Norway, Faculty of Humanities and Education, No-3603 Kongsberg, Norway.
- Herheim, R.; Werler, T. & Hauge, K. H. (2022). *Lived Democracy in Education*. Routledge: 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN. 605 Third Avenue, New York,

- NY, 10158.
- Kayalar, F. (2016). *Comparison of Ukrainian and Turkish Law Students' Attitudes towards Democratic Values. Cross-cultural Study*. Universal Journal of Educational Research, 4 (2), 409 – 415.
- Kesici, S. (2008). *Teachers' Opinions about Building a Democratic Classroom*. Journal of Instructional Psychology, 35 (2), 192 – 203.
- Napitupulu-Kisno, S. (2014). *Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL1)*. Halaman Moeka Publishing: Jakarta.
- Parker, W. (2003). *Teaching Democracy: Unity and Diversity in Public Life*. Teachers College Press, New York.
- Raiker, A., Rautiainen, M. & Saqipi, B. (2020). *Teacher Education and the Development of Democratic Citizenship in Europe*. Routledge 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN.
- Ranson, S. (2018). *Education and Democratic Participation: The Making of Learning Communities*. Routledge.
- Selvi, K. (2006). *Developing a Teacher Trainees' Democratic Values Scale: Validity and Reliability Analyses*. Social Behavior and Personality, 34 (9), 1171 – 1178.
- Turabik, T. & Gun, F. (2016). *The Relationship between Teachers' Democratic Classroom Management Attitudes and Students' Critical Thinking Dispositions*. Journal of Education & Training Studies, 4 (12), 45 – 57.
- Zachrisen, B. (2016). *The Contribution of Different Patterns of Teachers' Interactions to Young Children's Experiences of Democratic Values during Play*. International Journal of Early Childhood, 48 (2), 179 – 192.