

## Strengthening Pancasila Values through Conventional Traditional Wisdom

**Iskandarsyah Siregar**

Universitas Nasional, Indonesia

Email: regarangi@presidency.com

### ***Abstract:***

*The long process of economic modernization and political democracy in Indonesia has changed the face of Indonesian society, making it more focused on the industrial sector but has still not succeeded in moving the people's economic sector effectively. However, the dynamics of democratic politics in Indonesia are still far from the ideal mandated by the Pancasila deliberative values. Recent political and economic changes, such as development policies that pay less attention to local wisdom and increasingly widespread political liberalization, have had a negative impact on Indonesia's cultural diversity and identity. This research aims to rebuild understanding of local knowledge and political values held by various ethnic groups and communities in Indonesia, with the hope of discovering potential social capital that can be used to improve democratic political practices. The focus of this research is divided into two main aspects: first, analysis of ethnic groups with an emphasis on the Wajo and Minang tribes, and second, a review of several communities living in city parks on the island of Java. The theoretical approach applied is consultative democracy theory, which focuses on the importance of deliberation in the political decision-making process. Within the framework of political anthropology, this research is considered a case study that aims to understand more deeply the dynamics of local politics, as well as the cultural values contained therein. The research method used is qualitative-interpretive, which allows researchers to explore hidden meanings and understandings in the views and experiences of research subjects. Thus, it is hoped that this research will make an important contribution in strengthening the cultural and social foundations for more inclusive and sustainable democratic political practices in Indonesia*

### ***Keywords:***

*traditional wisdom; ethnicity, the path of modernisation; liberalisation; mutual democracy*

## **I. Introduction**

Scientific research investigating the role of voluntary groups based on ethnic aspects in national politics, especially in the context of Javanese culture, was carried out brilliantly by Parsudi Suparlan, a leading Indonesian anthropologist in 1975. This kind of political phenomenon is rare, considering that ethnic identity is often revealed. or hidden can trigger conflict. In Java, for example, there are various sub-cultures such as Santri who practice Islam conservatively, Abangan who have a thinner level of Islam, and Priyayi who are from the upper social class. The conflict in Ngandong Village, Klaten, in the post-Suharto era, shows complexity that exceeds the classic Santri-Abangan-Priyayi trichotomy approach proposed by Clifford Geertz.

In a situation that is different from the classical cultural structure in Java, Indonesian society is now facing the challenges of cultural complexity and political tension. The conflict in Ngandong Village, Klaten, Central Java, involved various elements of society, including priyayi who have a modern view of progress, as well as santri and abangan groups who have differen

religious orientations. It is important to note that this illustration is not intended to touch on the sensitivity of SARA issues, but rather to focus on democratic practices that are not in accordance with the principles of deliberation and agreement.

The story above is a snapshot of the many incidents of malpractice in the deliberation process, which indicates the loss of moral norms and traditional wisdom in various ethnic or cultural groups. One example of malpractice is in the Development Planning Deliberation (Musrenbang) mechanism, where even though the adoption of the participatory development concept has recognized the importance of community involvement, at the final stage of decision making, community participation is limited. Inappropriate understanding of the values of Pancasila, especially the Fourth Principle, is also seen in research which reveals a tendency for democracy to be more oriented towards voting rather than the actual deliberation process. In this way, the resulting policy products and implementation of democracy tend to marginalize the nation's fundamental values.

There is a need for our democracy to be extracted from the noble values of Indonesian tradition. Corrective steps must be taken to clarify what noble values, civility, or traditional wisdom exist among ethnic groups in Indonesia. This study intends to reconstruct this matter. In the idiom of legal experts, it is said that values and norms in society are the raw materials for formulating favourable laws. Thus, traditional wisdom among ethnic groups serves as raw materials for strengthening the conception and practice of democracy by the Pancasila mandate. How can a reconstruction be conclusively produced? First, from the theoretical aspect, this study will use the theoretical perspective of consultative democracy, which is the most recent development (state of the arts) of democratic theory. Second, a political, anthropological approach to understanding political culture among several ethnic groups and communities will be used.

Research will only have meant and may be carried out if it is able to reach at least one of the following two characteristics: urgency and interest (Siregar et al., 2021, p. 51). Based on this perspective, this research contributes in the form of re-exploring and strengthening high cultural values in the political realm, which is carried out through an in-depth political anthropology approach. Thus, this research has the potential to enrich our conceptualization and understanding of the principles of democracy contained in the Fourth Principle of Pancasila. More than that, this research can also encourage the practice of community deliberation or consultation, both within the community and in formal political processes

## **II. Review of Literature**

The first concept that will be discussed is traditional wisdom. According to the Oxford Dictionary, traditional wisdom refers to values and actions that have high moral standards in interactions related to public affairs. The term often used in this context is "noble national values". Meanwhile, the term "civil" has a meaning related to the city, especially in the context of its government, and relates to a person's duties or activities in relation to the city or local area. "Virtue" refers to behavior that displays high moral standards and superior or beneficial qualities.

Traditional wisdom is also closely related to the concept of politeness. According to the Oxford Dictionary, politeness can refer to formal politeness and polite behavior in speech or action, as well as polite speech in informal conversations. In Indonesia, politeness is often defined as civilized attitudes and social interactions, especially in speech and behavior.

Originally, politeness was closely related to the concept of civilized citizenship; the meaning of civility later developed from Middle English, derived from Old French, and from Latin "civilis" which means 'relating to citizens'. Originally, the term referred to being a citizen and thus being a good citizen or behaving with regularity. The concept of "courtesy" began to emerge in the mid-16th century. With this development, the original meaning of the term seems to be adopted in Indonesia as the courtesy of a civilized citizen.

Michael Morfit (1981, p. 843) found consultative democracy in Pancasila in his study. The latest theory of democracy is called consultative democracy (TDD). TDD was developed by Habermas, Cohen, Bohman, and others. In his research, Michael Morfit (1981, p. 843) concluded that the fourth principle of Pancasila has long rejected liberal democracy. "The word *musyawarah* is one connoting discussion and deliberation amongst members of a society....".

The main concepts of TDD are (1) belonging to the talking-centric group; (2) public-spiritedness; (3) deliberation capacity; (4) wider public segment involvement; and (5) the local cultural context. In her article on TDD, Simone Chambers (2003) mentions that "it is now commonplace to talk about the consultative turn." It should be clarified at the beginning of the presentation about TDD that in a simple concept, there is a difference between the concept of "participatory democracy" and "consultative democracy," as follows:

Dryzek (2005) from the Australian National University wrote an article, "Consultative Democracy in Divided Societies: Alternatives to Agonism and Analgesia." He seems to have found that many peoples in multicultural countries (from Malaysia in Asia to Switzerland in Western Europe) have managed to overcome the challenges of the political field intelligently and wisely by utilising their respective cultural resources, namely by taking a functional political path. With Lijphart's consociational democracy in Western Europe also being discussed, Dryzek then explained the solutions offered by the theoretical approaches and concepts of consultative democracy. First, Dryzek argues that for consultative democracy, there is a particular context in which the politics of a nation exists—namely that politics has been institutionalised with the specifics created by each country; Differences in views between people can be compromised through communication and discourse within the framework of interpretation through language through the process of intersubjectivity. The quality of the communication referred to is communication that (1) is capable of encouraging reflection among participants; (2) the nature of the communication is non-coercive (coercive, the language of power) and (3) able to relate specific "local/group experiences" with "normative ideas/principles or values that are more general. Second, achieve a contextual and reasonable democratic system and culture in heterogeneous nations. It is needed to replace the idea of electoral democracy (or politics to compete through elections) with electoral engineering. What Dryzek wrote is the proposal of Horowitz and Reilly (a kind of placement the status of life or the political process of a nation as a means of educating citizens towards a better perspective; analogous, perhaps, to a school or school of law in the world of law that places law as social engineering). Dryzek then mentions the forms used in Papua New Guinea and Northern Ireland.

Baiocchi (in Wright, 2003) describes TDD as follows: "Consultative democratic theory refers to a body of political thought that seeks to develop a substantive version of democracy based on public justifications, more discourse-based democracy. It calls for the deliberations of the citizen as good equals in the legitimate exercise."

The practice of consultative democracy and an egalitarian culture—or in the concept of what Habermas has recently called a public contemplative space, replacing a bourgeois public space—seems to have arisen at the beginning of industrialism in England. T. Christy, in a book review, makes an analysis of Consultative Democracy in coffee shops in England. This is related to the tradition of the elite class in England, fond of strange items from the East (Islamic Turkish civilisation), including coffee. The urban masses imitate drinking coffee in coffee shops; coffee shops become "markets for exchanging information and public discussion." In reviewing this book, Christy agrees with Cowan, who uses the lens of consultative democracy theory.

Cowan provides an interesting overview of the growing public political participation in urban communities. There is a tendency that Cowan continues Habermas' idea that the coffeehouse functions as a place for the actual exchange of information that partially obscures the origins or status of people when they enter the coffee shop" (Chris, 2006, p. 239). Christomy (2006) notes that Cowan conveys in Habermas' style that broad and inclusive community participation needs to be continuously filtered and served continuously to strengthen society. This highlights the importance of public participation in the political process.

The concept of Deliberative Democracy Theory (TDD) is closely related to the relationship between societal culture and democracy, which is a form of democracy that is different from democracy within a liberal framework. Sulaiman and Othman (2009) present the view that electoral politics in Sarawak requires analysis from a non-Western perspective, considering the role of ethnicity in the political process. They emphasize the need to develop models of democracy that take into account various ethnic cultures.

TDD aims to deepen and perfect representative democracy, focusing on the idea of "consultative democracy". This concept emphasizes the importance of discussing public issues without being too influenced by the interests of certain groups, as well as focusing on the substance of the discussion rather than the identity of the speaker.

In Taiwan, Lin (2009) shows that consultative democracy is demonstrated through government-sponsored consensus conferences, as a form of citizen participation. Farrelly from Queens University, Canada, explains Zurn's concept of consultative democracy, which highlights a critical view of the reasons-responsiveness of the state.

The expansion of the deliberative model from the local level to the city level represents an interesting trend in the practice of consultative democracy. For example, experiments in Porto Alegre, Brazil, show how important public participation is in municipal decision making. This model is also applied at the community level, as in the Village Revitalization Program in Minneapolis, USA, and in the development of specific sectors, such as the health sector in Brazil, where health sector councils help plan health development.

Another critical issue is the importance of voluntary associations. The push towards direct involvement in local government was again fueled by disappointment with the poor performance of regional governance mechanisms. In Canada, reformist peasants from several provinces adopted a procedure for drafting citizen-based legislation: "popular dialogue" helped shift institutional settlements in favour of more direct control." The importance of CSOs or NGOs/ORMAS or the third sector for the democratisation and efficiency of local governments has been discussed, among others, by Jan Bucah and Brian Smith (2000). The

third sector is the "structure of non-supramental organisation on the part of local governance the so-called third sector of voluntary bodies, not for profit organisations, community groups, and other local associations" (Bucek & Smith, 2000, p. 16). Fung (2003) traces several vital contributions made by voluntary associations in society (NGOs/Ormas) for improving the quality of democracy.

In the context of the relevant contributions, three aspects are worth noting. First, with the joining of NGOs/Ormas, there is an increase in the process of civic socialization and political education which aims to strengthen the democratic political behavior of society. The presence of these NGOs/Ormas is not only a means of increasing citizens' political awareness, but also a forum for teaching the values of good citizenship.

Second, participation in NGOs/Ormas can also strengthen the community's bargaining position in upholding public interests. The community, through NGOs/Ormas, has the ability to fight for common interests and demand representation of their interests in the decision-making process. Thus, NGOs/Ormas function as representatives of community interests in carrying out state functions.

Third, the existence of NGOs/Ormas can also be a bridge to encourage deliberation and the growth of a more practical public sphere. Through various activities and discussions organized by NGOs/Ormas, the community can participate in the deliberation process and expand the public space where ideas and aspirations can be expressed and discussed openly.

Fourth, the existence of NGOs/Ormas can also encourage the creation of more open and democratic governance. With the active involvement of NGOs/CSOs in supervising and monitoring government activities, transparency in public decision making can be increased. This can ensure that citizen participation in the political process continues to flow and is the basis of healthy democratic practice.

### **III. Research Methods**

In this research, the method used is a qualitative research method. Data collection was carried out simultaneously with the development of concept categories from various materials based on certain principles. Data is taken from secondary sources, such as books and scientific journals, which discuss traditional wisdom. These categories are then organized based on key concepts in democratic culture and democratic social institutions.

The perspective of consultative democracy theory is the theoretical basis used in this research. This approach includes four main concepts: (1) the involvement of all segments of society, (2) the practice of deliberation, (3) the participatory spirit of society, and (4) the possibility of formulating empirical generalizations as the concept develops.

The data collection process involves searching for information from written sources related to traditional wisdom. The data obtained is then analyzed and grouped based on the main concepts that have been determined. Each category of these concepts is studied to understand their implications and relevance in the context of democratic culture and social institutions.

By using a qualitative approach, this research aims to understand and explain the phenomenon of traditional wisdom in a democratic context. It is hoped that various findings and analyzes can provide a deeper understanding of the dynamics of democratic culture and the role of social institutions in building a participatory society.

By applying the perspective of consultative democracy theory, this research also seeks to identify potentials that can strengthen the principles of participatory democracy. Thus, it is hoped that the results of this research can provide a valuable contribution to the development of inclusive and sustainable democratic thought and practice.

#### **IV. Results and Discussion**

The traditional wisdom of the Wajo tribe, as noted by Zuhro and his colleagues (2009), is part of the Bugis community spread across the Wajo region, which is located in South Sulawesi Province. This region, although it only accounts for 4% of the area of South Sulawesi Province, has important historical value. One of the interesting villages to study is Tosora Village, where the ruins of an old mosque which traces the first entry of Islam to Wajo can be found behind the Tosora Village Head's Office.

Based on pre-Indonesian historical records, the Wajo people had a political system based on the commune principle. This is reflected in the establishment of the Wajo Kingdom above the citizenship of its people. Religious transformation from animism to Islam also occurred among the Wajo people as a response to the dynamics of interactions between kingdoms in the archipelago. This transformation has two important impacts: first, in the aspect of religious doctrine; and second, in the process of internalizing the values of justice and equality in Islamic ideology into their culture.

The process of Islamization in Wajo society, as studied by Hasanuddin (2013), showed initial signs in 1610. Traces of this Islamization are reflected in several relics, including the ruins of the Old Mosque in Tosora, Majauleng District, various prayer rooms, and gedong (ammunition storage building). The importance of this research is to understand how religious and cultural values interact and are contextualized in the Wajo community, as well as how their Islam has characteristics that can be called accommodative Islam.

The tradition of political contracts is also an important part of the culture of the Wajo people. Around 605 years ago, under the Bajo tree, there was a historical event where the word "Wajo" was adopted as the community's identity. At that time, in an atmosphere of independence and sovereignty, a social contract occurred between the community and traditional leaders, who then agreed to the formation of the Wajo Kingdom.

One of the main aspects of citizenship in the culture of the Wajo people is the value of equality, which refers to the same position for all citizens. This also applies in the context of leadership. Zuhro and colleagues (2009) explained that the process of selecting leaders is carried out based on the competencies possessed by potential leaders, who can come from ordinary circles. Apart from that, the practice of deliberation was also emphasized, where every problem in the group was discussed together under the Bajo tree, which later became the origin of the term "mayor-wajo".

Apart from that, political participation is also reflected in the form of protest if injustice occurs by the King or leader. In addition, in response to perhaps unfair experiences in government, a developmental stage emerged in the kingmaking process with the introduction of political contracts. The appointment of a king through this contract is a characteristic of the Wajo Kingdom which differentiates it from other kingdoms in South Sulawesi.

The principle of deliberation with Saiyo Sakato, which was the first, illustrates that differences of opinion between individuals are a common thing in social life. However, efforts to reach consensus in contemplation are still being made to find a solution. Decisions can be taken in various ways, either through unanimous acclamation or through voting which may produce a more even or narrow result. The final decision is taken after consensus deliberation, and all parties are expected to comply.

The second highlights the deliberation place which is known by various names such as a wide open field, Kurisu Salapan (seater of eight), or Medan nan Ayahaneh, or a fairly large hot field with a stone hall and rows of stone chairs. At this stage, the democratic procedure applied is direct democracy. Then, with further development, representative democracy was introduced. The deliberation process continues to develop throughout history, from pre-Hindu times to the period of Islamic influence and colonialism. As the complexity of people's lives increases, many problems arise that require resolution through deliberation. When life becomes increasingly complicated, people shift their trust in solving problems to the princes or traditional leaders. These leaders then gathered to discuss various matters related to the Nagari government, resolve disputes, and decide on other important matters.

The study conducted by Zuhro et al. highlighting Nagari Minangkabau as the focus of research to explore democratic values and behavior in that society, considering its role as the center for the birth and development of Minangkabau culture and social structure. Nagari Minangkabau, which is one of the oldest Nagari in West Sumatra Province, offers an interesting context for understanding the history and evolution of democracy in the area.

Nagari Minangkabau, which is located in Batusangkar City, is known for its economy which is dominated by the agriculture, fisheries and livestock sectors. Its strategic location makes it an interesting object of study in research on government systems and the social values contained therein.

According to research collected by Zuhro et al., initially the government system in Minangkabau reflected two different models: a democratic model inspired by the philosophy of Bodi Chaniago and an aristocratic model derived from the philosophy of Koto Piliang. However, over time, this system was transformed into a more democratic one, with Islamic influence increasingly expanding its influence in the Minangkabau region. This change can be seen as the result of a fusion between the two traditions, which is believed to have started with the arrival of Islam to the area.

Interestingly, Zuhro et al. refers to the work of classical sociologist Mochtar Naim to explain the impact of Islam on Minangkabau social structure. They wrote that Islam is considered to bring egalitarian teachings which emphasize that a person's dignity is not determined by status or descent, but by his devotion to Allah. These egalitarian values were also influenced by historical events such as the French and American Revolutions, as well as the leadership of the Prophet Muhammad S.A.W in the 6th century AD.

One aspect of civil obligation that stands out is the political structure that is manifested in the customary authority system, the peak of which is held by a penghulu. According to local beliefs, the headman is elected from among the tribe's members and has the responsibility to guide and oversee the interests of the tribe. The next election for the prince was carried out by his nephew, who was his sister's son. In carrying out his role, the penghulu is given support by one or several people who are called penghulu penongkat.

Apart from that, there is also the inheritance of authority from the koto piliang tradition which includes four collective leadership positions, known as urang ampek jinih. These positions include penghulu, priest who has authority in religious knowledge, manti, and Hulubalang who has authority in matters of customs. Although there are variations in the collective leadership model, it seems that the main model is the tigo sejarangan system, where there are three leaders who complement each other in the Nagari system. In this context, the penghulu leads in the social realm, the ulama is responsible for religious matters, while the intelligent (intellectual) leads in matters related to social, economic and educational life.

The practice of consultative democracy was the first highlight in the case that occurred in Taman Bungkul, Surabaya. Although for most Indonesians this phenomenon is considered normal, for researchers who pay attention to the failure of representative democracy and master contemporary theories about deliberative democracy and Habermas's idea of the public sphere, this phenomenon is considered very important. The cycling community, led by Faridah and Rahman, conducted field research on this practice. They found that in Bungkul Park, people gathered, discussed, and generated ideas which they then submitted to the local government to influence political policy.

Bungkul Park, which is located in the city of Surabaya, has an area of more than 3000 square km and is surrounded by Jalan Taman Bungkul and Jalan Raya Darmo. Originally designed as a green open space, in the last three years, this park has focused more on local tourism. In addition, visiting residents can purchase food and drink from local vendors, and cultural events are also held, including those broadcasts on local TV.

One of the communities formed in Bungkul Park is the SENAPATI (True Patriot Ancient Bicycles) community, which discusses various topics ranging from local to national news. In Faridah and Rahman's research, the Chair of SENOPATI turned out to be a retired member of the DPRD.

This community is also involved in aligning aspirations with the city government, including voicing the need for special lanes for bicycles. The conversation between community members started after one of their members had an accident on the road. The results of these discussions were then proposed to the Surabaya City Government, which ultimately responded positively by opening a special lane for bicycles.

Apart from that, Bungkul Park is also considered a suitable place to realize consultative democracy in discussing state policies. However, the bicycle lane project experienced delays due to obstacles from corporate sponsors and disapproval from some members of the public. However, after deliberation, the decision to continue the project was finally accepted in the public interest.

Consultative democratic practices are not always considered important, as noted by Farida and Rahman (2013). However, in Taman Bungkul, Surabaya, the method of interaction

and conversation between communities is an example of how consultative democracy can occur. For most Indonesians, activities in Taman Bungkul may seem ordinary, but for those who understand the failure of representative democracy and study contemporary theories of deliberative democracy, Habermas' concept of public space will be highly appreciated. Through observations at Bungkul Park, the two researchers noted that the bicycle community, among other things, had generated meaningful discussions and brought the results to the local government for attention in public policy.

The importance of understanding the Taman Bungkul phenomenon as an innovative way of thinking is a necessity. In studying this phenomenon, we need to adopt theories from abroad because our social sciences are still underdeveloped and have not been able to produce significant contributions. However, we must appreciate the ability of our citizens who have been able to create a democratic atmosphere in accordance with the noble values of the Indonesian nation, without having to completely adopt foreign concepts.

Research conducted by Rendra Wahyu Kurniawan revealed the history of the square as a changing public space. From the time of the Mataram Kingdom in Tulungagung Regency until it became a trading place during the independence era, then again functioning as a public space today. However, during the Dutch colonial period, the square was fenced off and a prison was built around it, reflecting the separation between the rulers and the people. However, now the square has returned to being a place for play and recreation surrounded by trees and ornamental plants. Various communities such as The Breaking Rooster Crew, Skateboard Community, and BMX Bike Lovers often gather there, along with other communities such as reptile and ferret lovers.

Through various activities and interactions in Bungkul Park, a dynamic public space is formed where various community groups can participate and contribute to the decision-making process related to common interests. Research conducted by Kurniawan provides an overview of various communities and residents of Tulungagung in shaping public discourse. He revealed that the emergence of various creative groups and communities from the younger generation in Tulungagung Regency, such as the Youth Association (PSM), the Tulungagung Grafitti Community, and the Creative Youth Community (KMK), was the result of the use of public spaces, especially open fields. Although some communities are not directly involved in politics, they often respond to political issues when gathering in public spaces, showing the political participation of the younger generation in various communities.

Apart from the open field, the Pendopo (the regent's official residence) is also used as a place to accommodate the aspirations of the community. Each discussion panel at Pendopo ensures the presence of representatives from each village to ensure that aspirations from various levels of society can be fully absorbed. In addition, the practice of deliberation is not only limited to the Tulungagung Regency Square, but also occurs in several coffee shops that have sprung up in the area, which have become alternative public spaces for the community.

Furthermore, the practice of political contracts carried out by one of the ethnic groups studied showed significant progress. By utilizing social capital, hope arises that current political contracts will be of higher quality and respected by all parties. The practice of family deliberation at the community level is also a form of social capital at a more basic community level. This social capital can influence political interactions which in turn influence local government policies, as seen in the case of the community in Taman Bungkul, Surabaya. This social capital is the initial basis for formulating more inclusive procedures and overcoming

various internal problems in society. With increased awareness and involvement of city residents, this social capital has the potential to encourage peaceful and effective political participation in shaping public policy by local governments.

## V. Conclusion

Values that reflect the moral superiority associated with democracy are clearly reflected in the culture and practices carried out by members of the ethnic groups studied. In addition, the traditional social institutions that are the center of research attention are also democratic political institutions that have grown and developed over time. By applying the concept of Consultative Democracy Theory, this research notes the potential of ethnic groups in Indonesia to strengthen democratic practices based on their cultural heritage. Substantially, this indicates that this is not just ordinary democracy, but is a true manifestation of the essence of Pancasila.

The application of modern values and institutions originating from the West in a democratic context must take into account the cultural richness of local democracies that have existed for many years. To achieve this goal, contemporary democratic regulation and practice must take into account the mutually supportive relationships of local democracy that have accumulated throughout history. This is very important to avoid efforts by the Central Government to create uniform policies in the implementation of the democratic process.

## References

- Abdullah, Taufik. 2014. "Tun Sri Lanang and the Malay Natural Cultural Association". *Journal of Society and Culture*. Vol 16 (1) 2014, p. 1-26.
- Anjani, S. D., & Siregar, I. (2023). Health Vitality of the Betawi Language in the Future in Jakarta: A Sociolinguistic Study. *Formosa Journal of Sustainable Research*, 2(3), 623–640. <https://doi.org/10.55927/fjsr.v2i3.3521>
- Anjani, S. T., & Iskandarsyah Siregar. (2023). The Existence of Palang Pintu Culture in the Opening Procession of Betawi Traditional Weddings (Case Study: George Herbert Mead's Symbolic Interactionism). *Formosa Journal of Sustainable Research*, 2(3), 641–666. <https://doi.org/10.55927/fjsr.v2i3.3517>
- Bucek, Jan & Brian Smith. 2000. "New Approaches to Local Democracy: Direct Democracy, Participation, and the "Third Sector." *Environment and Planning Governmental Policy*. Vol 18, p. 3-16
- Christomy, T. 2006. "The Coffee Shop and Habermas Thoughts" in *Discourse, Journal of the Humanities of Indonesia*, p. 236-240 (Brian Cowen's Book Review, *the Social Life of Coffee: The Emergence of the British Coffeehouse*. New Heaven & London: Yale Univ Press, 2005).
- Cohen & Joel "Power & Reason" in Archon Fung & Erik Olin Wright. 2013. *Deepening Democracy Institutional Innovations in Empowered Participatory Governance*. New York: Verso, page 241
- Dryzek, John S. (2005). "Consultative Democracy in Divided Societies: Alternatives to Agonism and Analgesia." *Political Theory*. Website: [https://openresearch-repository.anu.edu.au/bitstream/1885/41769/3/Dryzek\\_divided.pdf](https://openresearch-repository.anu.edu.au/bitstream/1885/41769/3/Dryzek_divided.pdf) Accessed 8 May 2017

- Faridah & A. Rahman. 2013. "Use of Bungkul Park as a Public Space in Realizing Consultative Democracy (Case Study of the Senopati Community)." *Moral & Citizenship Studies*, Vol I (1), p. 116-132
- Farrelly, Collin. 2009. "The Consultative Democracy and the Institution of Judicial Review in Social Theory and Practice," (Proquest Sociology. Apr 2009 Vol 35 No. 2), in "Book Review," Christopher F Zurn, *Consultative Democracy and the Institutions of Judicial Review*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Fung, Archon. 2003. "Associations and Democracy: Between Theories, Hopes, and Realities," *Annual Review Sociology*.  
<http://www.archonfung.net/papers/FungAnnRevSoc03.pdf>, pp. 515 – 539.
- Ghifari, H., & Siregar, I. (2023). The Effect of Service Quality and Promotion on Visiting Decisions at Betawi Cultural Villages. *Formosa Journal of Sustainable Research*, 2(3), 607–622. <https://doi.org/10.55927/fjsr.v2i3.3516>
- Indar Arifin, Indar. 2009. "Good Governance and Regional Development in the Frame of Local Values: A Study of Bureaucracy and Social Change in Kab, Wajo" *Government: Journal of Governance Science* Vol 2 (1), p. 63-79
- Liu, Shih-Diing. 2008. "Undomesticated Hostilities: The Affective Space of Internet Chat Rooms across the Taiwan Strait, in *Positions: East Asia Cultures Critique*, Vol 16 (2), Fall 2008, p. 435-455.
- Melo, Marcus Andre & Gian Paola Baiocchi, "Consultative Democracy and Local Governance: Towards A New Agenda," *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, Vol. 30 (3) September 2006, 578 – 600
- Morfit, Michael. 1981. "Pancasila: The Indonesian State Ideology According to The New Order Government." *Asian Survey*, Vol 21 (8), August, pp. 836-853.
- Sabrina, A., Siregar, I., & Sosrohadi, S. (2021). Lingual Dominance and Symbolic Power in the Discourse of Using the PeduliLindungi Application as a Digital Payment Tool. *International Journal of Linguistics Studies*, 1(2), 52–59. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijls.2021.1.2.8>
- Salsabila, Siregar, I., & Sosrohadi, S. (2021). Analysis of Code Mixing in Jerome Polin Youtube Content "Nihongo Mantappu". *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Translation*, 4(12), 01–08. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijllt.2021.4.12.1>
- Saputra, A. S., & Iskandarsyah Siregar. (2023). Implementation of DKI Jakarta Provincial Regulation Number 4 of 2015 Concerning the Preservation of Betawi Culture (Case Study: Education Curriculum). *Formosa Journal of Sustainable Research*, 2(3), 591–606. <https://doi.org/10.55927/fjsr.v2i3.3518>
- Siregar, Iskandarsyah. (2016). *Eksposisi General Psikolinguistik*. Jakarta: LPU Unas
- Siregar, I., Rahmadiyah, F., & Siregar, A. F. Q. (2021). Therapeutic Communication Strategies in Nursing Process of Angry, Anxious, and Fearful Schizophrenic Patients. *British Journal of Nursing Studies*, 1(1), 13–19. <https://doi.org/10.32996/bjns.2021.1.1.3>
- Siregar, I., Rahmadiyah, F., & Siregar, A. F. Q. (2021). Auditorium Model Assessment with Corrected Acoustic Function. *British Journal of Physics Studies*, 1(1), 01–06. Retrieved from <https://al-kindipublisher.com/index.php/bjps/article/view/2610>
- Siregar, I. & Siregar, R. (2021). The Relevances between Poda Na Lima Philosophy with Islamic Perspective. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v4i4.3240>
- Siregar, I. & Salsabila. (2021). Acts of Illocutionary Speech by Ganjar Pranowo in the "One Hour Closer" Talkshow. *International Journal of Arts and Humanities Studies*, 1(1), 95–100. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijahs.2021.1.1.14>

- Siregar, I. & Sabrina, A. (2021). Representation of Religious Values in Gurindam Twelve and Their Relevances with Modern Era. *International Journal of Cultural and Religious Studies*, 1(1), 50–57. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijcrs.2021.1.1.7>
- Siregar, I. (2021). Verbal Communication of Schizophrenic Patients Due to Neurotransmitter Distortion. *QALAMUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, Dan Agama*, 13(2), 543-556.
- Siregar, I. (2020). Exploration and Implementation of the Cultural System as a Solution to National and State Problems. <http://repository.unas.ac.id/id/eprint/811>
- Siregar, I. (2021). Analysis of Betawi Language Interference on the Morphology of Adolescent Speech in Jakarta. *Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences Studies*, 3(8), 54-60. <http://doi.org/10.32996/jhsss.2021.3.8.7>
- Siregar, I. (2020). *Geografi Leksikon Betawi*. Jakarta: LPU Unas
- Siregar, I. (2021). Epistemological Challenges Against Sociolinguistics. *International Journal of Linguistics Studies*, 1(2), 37–42. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijls.2021.1.2.6>
- Siregar, I. (2021). The Existence of Culture in its Relevance to the Dynamics of Globalization: Bahasa Indonesia Case Study. *International Journal of Cultural and Religious Studies*, 1(1), 33–38. Retrieved from <https://www.al-kindipublisher.com/index.php/ijcrs/article/view/2285>
- Siregar, I., Rahmadiyah, F., & Siregar, A. F. Q. (2021). Linguistic Intervention in Making Fiscal and Monetary Policy. *International Journal of Arts and Humanities Studies*, 1(1), 50–56. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijahs.2021.1.1.8>
- Siregar, I., (2021). *Research Methodology*. Jakarta: Uwais Inspirasi Indonesia
- Siregar, I., Rahmadiyah, F., & Siregar, A. F. Q. (2021). The Impact of Multisensory Stimulation of Biological Organs in Dysarthria Patients as Articulation Skills Rehabilitation. *British Journal of Nursing Studies*, 1(1), 20–29. <https://doi.org/10.32996/bjns.2021.1.1.3z>
- Siregar, I., & Zulkarnain. (2021). CSR-Based Corporate Environmental Policy Implementation. *British Journal of Environmental Studies*, 1(1), 51–57. Retrieved
- Siregar, I. (2022). Cyber Library Auditorium Acoustic Evaluation in Acoustic Phonetic Perspective. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v5i1.4234>
- Siregar, I. (2022). Islamic Values in Palang Pintu Procession in Semiotic Perspective. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v5i1.4239>
- Siregar, I. (2022). Criticism of Philosophical Approaches to Sociolinguistics. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v5i1.4233>
- Siregar, I. (2022). The Effectiveness of Linguistics in Studying Fiscal and Monetary Policy Issues. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v5i1.4235>
- Siregar, I. (2022). The Effectiveness of Multisensory Stimulation Therapy in People with Specific Language Disorder. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v5i1.4238>
- Siregar, I. (2022). Semiotics Analysis in The Betawi Traditional Wedding "Palang Pintu": The Study of Semiotics Roland Barthes. *International Journal of Linguistics Studies*, 2(1), 01–07. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijls.2022.2.1.1>
- Siregar, I., & Zulkarnain. (2022). The Relationship between Conflict and Social Change in the Perspective of Expert Theory: A Literature Review. *International Journal of Arts and Humanities Studies*, 2(1), 09–16. <https://doi.org/10.32996/bjahs.2022.2.1.2>

- Siregar, I. (2022). Implications of Learning Methods Based on Multisensory Stimulation Therapy in Patients with Transcortical Aphasia. *I T A L I E N I S C H*, 12(1), 809–818. <https://doi.org/10.1115/italienisch.v12i1.252>
- Siregar, I. (2022). Papuan Tabla Language Preservation Strategy. *LingLit Journal Scientific Journal for Linguistics and Literature*, 3(1), 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.33258/linglit.v3i1.620>
- Siregar, I. (2022). Language Response as a Cultural Element to Globalization. *Lakhomi Journal Scientific Journal of Culture*, 3(1), 8-18. <https://doi.org/10.33258/lakhomi.v3i1.619>
- Siregar, I. (2022). Semiotic Touch in Interpreting Poetry. *Britain International of Linguistics, Arts, and Education (BIO LAE-Journal)*, 4(1), 19-27. <https://doi.org/10.33258/biolae.v4i1.618>
- Siregar, I., & Yahaya, S. R. (2022). Semiotic Exploration of Roti Buaya as a Cultural Ornament. *British Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 2(1), 06–13. <https://doi.org/10.32996/bjal.2022.2.1.2>
- Siregar, I. (2022). Effective and Efficient Treatment of Regional Language Preservation Strategies in the Nusantara. *Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences Studies*, 4(2), 16–22. <https://doi.org/10.32996/jhsss.2022.4.2.3>
- Siregar, I., & Yahaya, S. R. (2022). Betawi Speech Shift in Internal Family Communication. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v5i4.7511>
- Siregar, I. (2022). Correlation and Logical Consequences between Pancasila and the Perspective of Tradition. *Lakhomi Journal Scientific Journal of Culture*, 3(4), 170-181. <https://doi.org/10.33258/lakhomi.v3i4.864>
- Siregar, I. (2022). Viewpoints and Perspectives of Batak Migrants on Dalihan Na Tolu: The Exposition Revision. *Lakhomi Journal Scientific Journal of Culture*, 3(4), 182-193. <https://doi.org/10.33258/lakhomi.v3i4.865>
- Siregar, R., Zulkarnain., & Siregar, I. (2022). Analysis of Naturally Hospitable Alternative Energy Cultivation Regulations. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v5i1.4422>
- Siregar, I., Yahaya, S. R. (2023). Model and Approaches to Preserving Betawi Language as an Endangered Language. *Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 9(1), 274-283. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.32601/ejal.901023>
- Siregar, I., Anjani, S. D., & Yahaya, S. R. (2023). Projection of the Vitality of the Betawi Language in the Future Time in Jakarta. *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Translation*, 6(3), 39–46. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijllt.2023.6.3.4>
- Siregar, I. (2023). Basic Techniques and Approaches in Preserving the Endangered Betawi Language. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v6i2.7603>
- Siregar, I. (2023). Description of the Condition of the Betawi Language in Future Developments. *Budapest International Research and Critics in Linguistics and Education (BirLE) Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birle.v6i2.7557.g7494>
- Siregar, I. (2023). Democratic Liberal Theory Based on Literature Review. *Konfrontasi Journal: Culture, Economy and Social Changes*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/konfrontasi2.v10i1.265>
- Siregar, I. (2023). The Dynamics of Communication Forms in the Betawi Language in Community Implementation. *Budapest International Research and Critics in Linguistics and Education (BirLE) Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birle.v6i2.7556.g7493>

- Siregar, I. (2023). Determination of Aesthetic Acts as Resistance by Social Society. *Konfrontasi Journal: Culture, Economy, and Social Changes*.  
<https://doi.org/10.33258/konfrontasi2.v10i1.266>
- Siregar, I. (2023). The Technical Essence of Poda Na Lima as the Foundation of Public Health Philosophy. *Lakhomi Journal Scientific Journal of Culture*, 4(1), 1-11.  
<https://doi.org/10.33258/lakhomi.v4i1.866>
- Siregar, I. (2023). The Role of Language in a Dynamic Situation of Globalization. *Britain International of Linguistics, Arts and Education (BIO LAE) Journal*.  
<https://doi.org/10.33258/biolae.v5i1.868>
- Siregar, I. (2023). The Re-Evaluation of Function Hall Acoustic Phonetic Condition. *LingLit Journal Scientific Journal for Linguistics and Literature*, 4(1), 49-58.  
<https://doi.org/10.33258/linglit.v4i1.867>
- Siregar, I., & Yahaya, S. R. (2023). The Betawi Lexicon of Kinship and Greeting. *Formosa Journal of Sustainable Research*, 2(3), 667–680.  
<https://doi.org/10.55927/fjsr.v2i3.3522>
- Siregar, I. (2023). Phenomenological Analysis of Consumer Shopping Behavior in Asia and Europe. *Konfrontasi: Jurnal Kultural, Ekonomi Dan Perubahan Sosial*, 10(1), 25-33.  
<https://doi.org/10.33258/konfrontasi2.v10i1.264>
- Siregar, I. (2023). Phenomenological Views of Pancasila Perspectives about Democracy. *Polit Journal Scientific Journal of Politics*, 3(3), 170–181.  
<https://doi.org/10.33258/polit.v3i3.975>
- Sulistiyono, Tri Singgih. 2015. "Multiculturalism in the Perspective of Coastal Culture." *Agastya's Journal*. Vol 5 (1), January, pp. 1-18